Bilingual Co-teaching 2015-2016

Summary
This is a description of a Spanish bilingual co-teaching model that seeks to enhance the experience of teachers from different fields of expertise when collaborating in the integration of art with content area instruction in two languages, and to enrich the quality of the experience and education of elementary school children in dual language programs when visiting an art museum. In this model University of Texas at Austin undergraduate bilingual education pre-service teachers and graduate students in art education and art history collaborate in planning and teaching a series of gallery lessons for students that attend one-way and two-way dual language schools. This approach supports the Freirian concept of dialogic action with the intent to facilitate the engagement of all learners regardless of linguistic background, in the construction of meaning and exploration of thoughts and feelings that art interpretation provides. The model is multi-faceted: it explores the relevancy and engagement of school-age learners in a bilingual museum setting, the dynamic of educators from diverse backgrounds in a bilingual context when co-teaching, and the experience of teaching with art objects for pre-service classroom teachers.
Description
The Blanton Museum of Art is entering its second year of a multi-modal bilingual co-teaching pilot, in collaboration with the University of Texas at Austin's College of Education's Department of Curriculum and Instruction and their Department of Bilingual and Bicultural Education. This approach supports the Freirian concept of dialogic action. It also works with the definition of dialogic as used by Russian philosopher Mikhail Bahtkin in which the term relates and links current knowledge to both prior and future knowledge. It also borrows from the writing of Rika Burnham and Elliot Kai-Kee in their book, *Teaching in the Art Museum* (2001). This model has potential to enrich and enliven the quality of education that takes place at the Blanton for K-12 and public audiences. Two co-teaching variations are currently being implemented: gallery teacher-to-gallery teacher and Spanish bilingual (discussed here). Within each variation, different types of collaborative co-teaching are possible: mentoring, station teaching, co-teaching.

The Spanish bilingual variation of the co-teaching model partners Andrea Saenz Williams, Museum Educator for School and Teacher Programs with Dr. Haydee M. Rodriguez, Clinical Assistant Professor and Bilingual Education Teacher Preparation Program Coordinator. Dr. Rodriguez has committed her students of bilingual education to working on this project during the fall and spring semesters of the 2015-2016 academic year.

The Spanish bilingual model will be implemented within the context of the museum's multi-visit programs: *Art Central* and *MVPs*. *Art Central* is a long-standing multi-visit program in which fourth and fifth grade students visit the museum three times during the school year. The program is instructed by *Art Central* gallery teaching fellows that are all Masters or Doctoral candidates in either art education or art and art history. *Art Central* has historically served schools that have high ELL and LEP populations. One-way and two-way dual language schools have been recruited to participate in the 2015-2016 *Art Central* program. *MVPs* contain similar content to the *Art Central* program but are available to grades 3-12 and are typically taught by the Blanton's volunteer gallery teachers (docents).

The time commitment of the bilingual co-teachers will be far less than the Blanton’s teaching cohort. The bilingual co-teachers are required attend a training session; participate in co-

---

planning meetings with their Blanton counterparts; and review readings and research related to the project. Bilingual co-teachers are requested to assist with observations, lead student activities, and participate in evaluative surveys and reflections.

Research methodologies are put into place from the start of the academic year. Qualitative data will include written reflections and interviews. Quantitative data will include pre- and post-experience surveys. The Blanton’s Education Department is reaching out to UT faculty within the College of Education to find a partner for the research and evaluation process. Presentations about the project and findings have been proposed for the 2016 conferences of the National Association of Bilingual Education and the National Art Education Association.

**Year One Pilot**

Approximately 535 elementary students from five Austin ISD schools, thirty-two bilingual and bicultural education students (BBE), and five gallery teaching fellows participated in the bilingual co-teaching pilot. Much was learned during the first year about co-teaching in general, and about the nuances of bilingual co-teaching. Overall the pilot was well received. Observations and reflections provided during the fall trimester informed program structure and goals. Preliminary observations noticed that the majority of instruction took place in English. A goal of a 60/40 ratio of English to Spanish was established and re-iterated each time bilingual co-teaching occurred. It was also noticed that more structure was necessary for both the co-teachers and the observers. Changes were made to the observation sheet that BBE students used to document gallery lessons; a co-teaching structure (below) was established to guide

Above: BBE student Alina Iniguez-Smith leads a gallery activity in Spanish.
everyone in their preparation and planning.

Dana Reyna, the art teacher at Odom Elementary in AISD commented in her application for the 2015-2016 Art Central program that, “the students, parents, and teachers really liked the way that the students were able to participate in a deeper way. They felt like they had a safe environment and they were able to talk about works of art and how they felt in a more meaningful way.” Ms. Reyna went on to write, “Odom Elementary is a title one school. Many of our parents work very hard at work and many work two jobs and weekends to support their families. Many parents do not have a way to transport their children around town and often, our parents would feel inadequate talking to their children about works of art.” Observing bilingual interpretive conversations about works of art might help the parents at Odom become more comfortable with conversations about art in a variety of settings.

**Co-teaching Structure**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Art Central</th>
<th>Co-teaching Structure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gallery Lesson Duration</strong></td>
<td>50 Minutes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>To-do during introduction</strong></th>
<th><strong>To-do during each work of art and during activities</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual and Bicultural Education (BBE) Teacher</td>
<td>BBE Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduce self in Spanish. Tell students that they will be participating in a bilingual gallery lesson. Assure students that you will assist their understanding.</td>
<td>Experiment with leading discussions or activities in Spanish. Translate some questions or directions. Check for student understanding in Spanish.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>To-do during transitions</strong></th>
<th><strong>To-do during closing</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BBE Teacher</td>
<td>BBE Teacher</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Gallery Teaching Fellow (GTF)</strong></th>
<th><strong>GTF</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduce self in English. Tell students that they will be participating in a bilingual gallery lesson. Assure students that you will assist their understanding.</td>
<td>Provide wait time after asking questions for BBE teacher to translate.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>GTF</strong></th>
<th><strong>GTF</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provide directions and instruction in English. Check for understanding in English.</td>
<td>Provide closing comments in English.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Co-teacher Reflections and Comments

“I wouldn’t say that my thoughts have “changed” because in the abstract I’ve always had a sense of the value and necessity of bilingual education. That said, this project gave me concrete experience with bilingual education and demonstrated its value in a positive way. Bilingual facilitation is an incredible way to open up conversation, to offer students a new avenue to expressing themselves, and to increase their comfort and confidence in museum spaces. It was inspiring to see how conversation flourishes when students are given the option to respond in Spanish, which for some of them is a language they are more familiar with and have a greater command of than they do of English. It’s great to see students building on their language skills and making connections between words they know in one language and words they are learning in another. Often times students help each other out with translating from one language to another which is exciting to see because they are supporting each other’s learning and demonstrating confidence in their own abilities.”

-Brady Plunger, Blanton Gallery Teaching Fellow

“Nuestro trabajo con el museo ha dado a muchos estudiantes el apoyo para continuar a desarrollar su lengua nativa y tener orgullo de su cultura... si vemos que no hay programas bilingues en un museo, podemos ser defensores para empezarlos. Somos una fuerza que puede tener un impacto en la comunidad si tomamos accion.”

-Our work with the museum has given many students the support to continue to develop their native language and have pride in their culture... if we [bilingual teachers] don’t see bilingual programs in a museum, can be advocates to start them. We are a force that can have an impact on the community if we take action.

-Fall 2014 bilingual co-teacher

“This program I think could lead to a great relationship with the student teachers in the bilingual education program. I think a little more structure to the relationship between [BBE] co-teachers and the gallery teaching fellows would strengthen the gallery teaching. I knew little [about] best practices of bilingual teaching and the co-teachers expressed similar views [regarding] the touring models. …the more time spent with each other outside of touring was very beneficial to me and I could tell to the co-teachers as well. After meeting in person the co-teachers had more confidence and it felt that we were truly teaching together and not separately.”

-Hannah Baker, Blanton Gallery Teaching Fellow

“This experiencia para mi fue muy conveniente porque durante nuestras carreras como maestras van a haber ocasiones en donde vamos a tener maestros de asistencia o mentores.”

-This experience for me was very [timely] because during our careers as teachers [there] will be occasions where we will have teacher assistants or mentors.

-Fall 2014 bilingual co-teacher
Hi Alina,

I’m so glad that the experience was beneficial for you. It’s always a pleasure to work with bilingual teachers such as yourself and offer our ELL students an experience that I can’t provide on my own. Thanks again for joining us for our bilingual experiment!

We’re looking to refine the model as we go forward. If you get a chance, what do you think would help improve the program for the bilingual co-teachers? Would additional training for you guys be beneficial? Scheduled walk-throughs of the lesson plans? Something else? We’d like our co-teachers to feel as comfortable as possible in the galleries, leading activities and facilitating discussions with limited reliance on the English-speaking teacher’s intervention.

Once again, I’m very pleased that you enjoyed the experience as I did. Have a great summer and good luck in your future endeavors!

Best,
Tripp

On Fri, May 8, 2015 at 5:00 PM, Alina Iniguez <alinainiguez@yahoo.com> wrote:

I wanted to thank you for giving the opportunity to co-teach with you this semester. I learned a lot from the collaborations and the strategies used during the visits. I will definitely make use of these strategies and the incorporation of art in my future classroom instruction. Thank you!

Have a wonderful summer!

Sincerely,
Alina Iniguez-Smith

Right: Gallery Teaching Fellow Tripp Cardiff and BBE student Alina Iniguez-Smith in a co-teaching moment.
2014-2015 Participating Schools

All schools are within the Austin Independent School District.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Grade/s</th>
<th># Students</th>
<th>Multi-visit Program Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Becker</td>
<td>4, 5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Art and Feelings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Odom</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>Inquiring Minds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ortega</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Between the Lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanchez</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>Between the Lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wooten</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Inquiring Minds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Students</td>
<td></td>
<td>535</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Student Visits</td>
<td></td>
<td>1605</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Year Two Pilot

The second year of the bilingual co-teaching pilot will include three returning schools out of five total. The returning schools will participate in some additional evaluative measures to better understand the model's impact. 460 students are expected to participate, including Spring Hills Elementary from Pflugerville ISD. In her application to the Art Central program, teacher Lori Wallace wrote, "we are a bilingual campus with several students who have limited or no English. I would love for them to have a deeper connection to art in their own language."

The second year of the bilingual co-teaching model will also include students in grades two and three. This year, four gallery teaching fellows from the Blanton will be paired with approximately twenty-five BBE students. Year two of the pilot will continue to strive toward a 60/40 English to Spanish ratio. The co-teaching structure put in place last year will remain the same, with added emphasis on collaborative planning, reflection, and translanguage.

2015-2016 Participating Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Grade/s</th>
<th># Students</th>
<th>Multi-visit Program Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Becker, AISD</td>
<td>2, 3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Art and Feelings, Between the Lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Odom, AISD</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>Art Odyssey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elgin</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>Art and Feelings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanchez, AISD</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Between the Lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Students</td>
<td></td>
<td>271</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Student Visits</td>
<td></td>
<td>813</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bilingual Co-teaching: at a glance

What is Co-teaching in a Gallery Setting?
Co-teaching in a gallery setting is an instructional model in which a gallery teacher (C1) is paired with another person (C2) to facilitate a gallery lesson. The C2 might:

- Have knowledge or expertise in another field complementary to the C1.
- Have knowledge or expertise in the same field as C1.
- Be viewed by students as co-teacher or equal.
- Assist with planning the lesson.
- Lead or assist with pre-determined object stops.
- Alternate instruction with the C1.
- Alternate questioning or dialogue with the C1.
- Lead or assist with gallery activities.
- Speak in a language or use vernacular that is not understood by the C1, nor is translated.

What are the three collaboration styles used?
The Blanton will focus on three styles of collaboration that fall along a developmental spectrum. They are: mentoring, station teaching, and tandem teaching.²

- Mentoring
  With mentoring, one teacher has primary instructional responsibility while the other assists students, monitors behaviors or observes.

- Station Teaching
  Station teaching occurs when the co-teaching pairs divide the instructional content into parts. Each teacher instructs one of the groups. The groups then rotate or spend a designated amount of time at each station. Independent stations are often used along with the teacher-led stations.

- Co-teaching
  This style incorporates an invisible flow of instruction with no prescribed division of authority. Using a team-teaching strategy, both teachers are actively involved in the lesson. From the students' perspective, there is no clearly defined leader -- both teachers share the instruction, are free to interject information, and are available to assist students and answer questions.

Who does it serve?
ELL population (native Spanish speakers), K-12 students

How does it work?
Blanton gallery teaching fellows will be paired with collaborative facilitators (co-teachers). These co-teachers will be selected from a class provided by Dr. Haydee Rodriguez and will undergo a training provided by the education department. The gallery teaching fellows will also receive training in bilingual education and co-teaching strategies. The time commitment required of co-teachers will vary.

What are the benefits?
- Language acquisition benefits for ELL and LEP population.
- Transferable teaching skills for collaborative providers, including transferable knowledge about teaching with art objects in the classroom.
- Enhanced partnership with AISD and (eventually) other central Texas school districts.
- Enhanced relationships with UT School of Education.
- Potential for research; potential for developing a national model.

² Adapted from http://www.edutopia.org/blog/co-teaching-internship-model-teresa-heck
Who are the Blanton’s partners for the Spanish bilingual model?

- Dr. Haydee M. Rodriguez, UT College of Education, Department of Bilingual and Bicultural Studies
- Dr. Deb Palmer, UT College of Education, Department of Bilingual and Bicultural Studies
- Ph.D. candidates Lucia Cardenas and Desiree Pallais
- Invited One-way and Two-way Spanish Dual Language Schools from Central Texas ISDs
- Pre-service bilingual education teachers within the College of Education’s Department of Curriculum and Instruction Bilingual and Bicultural Education Program (students of Dr. Rodriguez)

Evaluation and Documentation
Methodologies for evaluation include:
- Pre- and post-participation surveys (classroom teachers, pre-service teachers, gallery teaching fellows)
- Post gallery lesson write ups by pre-service teachers and gallery teaching fellows, for anecdotal assessment
- Post gallery lesson feedback forms to be completed by classroom teachers
- Interviews, observation, and video recording
- Pre-service teachers will serve as peer observers of both bilingual collaborative model and observers of monolingual gallery lessons for comparison.

Limitations
- Co-teachers might feel constrained by co-teaching and sharing the role of lead in a conversation.
- Choosing the right fit for co-teachers will be important; co-teachers will need to acknowledge their own teaching strengths and weaknesses.
- The Spanish bilingual model will avoid translating, however recognizes that some translating might be necessary for collaborative conversation.
- Co-teaching pairs will need to monitor time carefully and be aware of and communicate the division of labor.
- Conversations can become much slower with a collaborative model. There are more voices, more questions being asked, etc. Co-teachers will need to be mindful of how much time is being spent in each conversation. Fewer objects of art may be included in these gallery lessons or activities might be shorter.

Delimitations
- Pre-service teachers often co-teach in other pre-service teaching contexts and might be more familiar with sharing power roles and conversational leadership than the gallery teaching fellows. This might benefit the model since the pre-service teachers will most likely spend less time planning and need to jump in to collaborative teaching. (Spanish bilingual model)
- A round robin session will be staged during the training sessions held at the beginning of each semester for the pre-service teachers and the gallery teaching fellows. This will enable everyone to choose with whom they would like to work. (Spanish bilingual model)
- The atmosphere for conversation can flow more naturally with this model.
- The co-teacher might seem less intimidating/authoritative with this model.
- Setting up for and executing activities is more efficient with two co-teachers.
- During transitions, it is easier to pay attention to more students and have individual conversations with students that might be shy talking in a whole group dynamic.